



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

matured judgment; but he is prepared to go a long ways with the writer though, most emphatically, not all the way. But whatever the faults of the paper or of the review, it seems clear that we are much in need of this type of study or otherwise we shall soon be swamped in a multiplicity of details.

N. C. NELSON

NORTH AMERICA

Teton Sioux Music. FRANCES DENSMORE. (Bureau of American Ethnology, Bulletin 61, pages 1-561, plates 1-82.) Washington, 1918.

In this volume Miss Densmore presents and analyzes 240 songs, and describes the ceremonies and occasions on which they are sung. Combined with her Chippewa music in Bulletins 45 and 53, this makes a total of 600 songs which she has rendered available from the two tribes. The volume of this material renders her work a most important contribution in a division of ethnology which is still in its infancy.

Fault will probably be found in some quarters with Miss Densmore's transcriptions on the ground that she has used ordinary musical notation with only an occasional indication of pitch deviation. It is to be hoped that she will not allow such criticism to disturb her. It is no doubt important that some study of primitive music be made with a finer determination of pitch values than the current musical notation allows. But until we know more of the deviations of pitch in our own vocal music, it would be pedantic to insist that a superior standard of discrimination be applied in primitive songs.

On the other hand, the author's treatment of tonality seems open to more valid objection. In assuming the tonality of each song she obviously predetermines its scale and therefore the scales of Sioux music in general. By her non-observance of this fact, Miss Densmore seems to have vitiated entirely the value of her tables 1, 2, 3, 6, 7, 8, and 14 both in her analyses of the Sioux songs (page 12) and the comparison with Chippewa (page 26). It is true that the question of tonality and scale in primitive music is difficult, and that just because the feeling for tonality is obviously less rigid than among ourselves, and the scale somewhat looser, any method of attack is open to a certain arbitrariness. At the same time there is a definite problem, and to take our own system as the point of departure precludes any possibility of determining the native system, however vague this may be. The author's tabulations would certainly have shown more if she had attempted at the outset to ascertain the tone which in native feeling seemed in each song to correspond most closely to our tonic. This would probably be a tone brought into

prominence by repetition or accentuation, possibly by the structure of the melody; and would, with high probability, be either the first or the last note of the song. In many cases there might be doubt as between these alternatives; but the tabulation of the entire analyzed material, first on the basis of one assumption—say that such tonality as there was resided in the last note—and then of another,—say the first note,—would have provided two or more sets of interpretations of the material. Between these there might then have been a distinct choice on the ground that one method of interpretation yielded a greater consistency of system than the other. Even this plan could not be expected to carry us very far; yet it would at least have been an endeavor to obtain objective results. Miss Densmore's assumption of tonality is unscientific because it is subjective—subjective not in the personal sense, it is true, but with reference to our music.

Her tabulation of the tonal compass of the songs is free from this fault, and of interest. The same may be said of her studies of intervals and progressions. Downward progressions are nearly twice as numerous as the upward. This is partly due to the descending tendency of the songs as wholes, and partly to the fact that the intervals in upward progressions tend to be larger. The average interval is very nearly three semitones.

Miss Densmore's comparison between the older and more recent songs (pages 22 to 25, with indications throughout in the tables) is a most laudable innovation. The newer songs (presumably composed in the last half century) show some tendency to smaller compass of tone, to beginning with an upward progression and with an accented part of the measure, to avoiding change of time, and to increasing the number of distinct "rhythmic units" within a single song. Other features, as the average interval, have hardly altered. The author possibly makes somewhat more of the changes than her material warrants, and it is of course difficult to estimate the age of many songs; but on the whole there can be no doubt that she has developed in this matter an interesting and promising line of attack.

Her comparison of Chippewa and Sioux music contains some interesting results (tables 5A, 9A, 10A, 11A, 12A, 13A, 14A, and 17A) whose detailed discussion lack of space forbids. On the whole, Chippewa and Sioux music are probably quite similar. It is to be hoped that Miss Densmore will not only continue her researches along this line, but give them greater geographic range. As it is now, there is nothing in the author's work to indicate whether Sioux or Chippewa music may not

be substantially identical as compared with the total range of American systems, or on the other hand may represent extremes. Even the comparison with the smaller collections made by other authors from other tribes would have helped greatly—Miss Fletcher's Omaha material, for instance, or some of the fairly extensive series from the southwest or northwest. With Miss Densmore's experience she should have little difficulty in using the work of other observers, and allowing at least to some degree for the differences of perception or method. Or, researches of her own, based on a hundred songs from each of six tribes—say a pair from each of three widely separated regions—would have given an immensely wider outlook on native American music in general than the present six hundred songs from two contiguous tribes. And this enhanced perspective would have more than made up for any minor inaccuracies resulting from less thorough acquaintance with the several groups.

The graphic plots (pages 51 to 54) are very interesting, and will no doubt yield important results when more systematically applied. The indication in the transcriptions of the "rhythmic units," and their subsequent tabulation (page 525), is also to be commended as contributing to the clearness of structural analysis.

The major part of the volume consists of transcriptions, individual analyses, and ethnological material. This rather diverse mass of material is presented in a dovetailed manner that is unlikely to satisfy either the musical student or the ethnologist. Musically there is nothing gained, and normally something lost, by having two songs and their analyses separated by a ceremonial description or biography. Reciprocally, the student of Sioux religion will feel the same way about the interspersed songs. The author appears to have had a feeling that a song could be best studied in relation to its place in the culture. Ultimately, this feeling is correct. But in its first aspect a song presents a musical problem and must be brought into relation with other musical material. It is probably only after the music and the religion of the Sioux have been separately worked out with some care that endeavors to determine the relation between the two can be seriously fruitful.

For instance, on page 53 Miss Densmore presents five types of melodic outlines:

The character of type C is a repetition of the lowest tone, usually the keynote, the melody descending to the keynote, returning to a higher tone and again descending to the lowest tone, with a repetition of that tone. . . . It will be recalled that the element of affirmation was very strong in the treatment of the

sick. . . . Reference to the analyses of songs used in treating the sick will show a large proportion of these songs ending on the keynote. . . . Type D . . . first noted in the songs of Dream societies, . . . is characterized by a short ascent and descent frequently repeated in the melody. . . . Practically all are songs concerning men or animals in motion.

The implication of these passages would seem to be that a melody which substantially repeats its course suggests affirmation and hence confidence to the Sioux, and that one whose course wavers, suggests the motions of dream men or animals. If this is the author's interpretation, it should be received with some misgivings. It is very doubtful whether much rationalization can be expected of any normal music. Even if such an element exists, it would probably be secondary to a more objective association between a musical type and a cultural type. The Sioux, like other Indians, no doubt possess a distinctive class of songs used in shamanism, just as they have distinct types of music associated with gambling, love-making, and various kinds of ritual. The first requisite in the face of this situation however is a wholly objective determination of the type of the shamanistic songs as compared with the other types of songs. How far there may also be a connection in subjective feeling or reasoning between shamanistic music and shamanistic practice, is a separate problem, a subsequent one, and in the nature of things, an extremely delicate one. Our own church music expresses a variety of emotions in a similarity of forms. Everyone recognizes a hymn tune as a hymn tune, although one hymn professes to express joy, another resignation, and a third adoration. An endeavor to correlate among the body of our hymns particular musical forms with these several emotions would seem justified only after the normal form of our hymns as music had been established with reference to our music in general. In other words, a piece of music associated with a certain cultural activity is first of all music, secondly a piece of culture, and only lastly and indirectly an expression of personal emotion.

Miss Densmore should not feel discouraged at these strictures. She has done so much that it is impossible to resist the temptation of pointing out how by a slight change of method, and by a broadening of scope not necessarily involving a greater employment of time, she could have done even more. There are so few workers in this extremely interesting field that coördination of effort is imperative. No investigator operating in spiritual singlehandedness can attain to full fruition. Very little technique of investigation and interpretation has been established. Each student is experimenting in method—now successfully, and again mis-

takenly. Each must profit by the errors and attainments of the others. In that case it will not be long before a body of information is assembled and a mass of tried methods is available which will allow of much more rapid progress on the part of each individual collaborator.

A. L. KROEBER

The Ethnogeography of the Tewa Indians (Twenty-ninth Annual Report of the Bureau of American Ethnology). JOHN PEABODY HARRINGTON. Pages 37-636, 16 pls., 30 maps. Washington, 1916.

This scholarly work, whose size and detail approximate the monumental, deserves notice first of all as one of the few exact ethnogeographic studies published in the American field in recent years. It represents a side of research which, with the allied topics of politics and economics, has been unduly neglected. Subjects such as these scarcely lend themselves to purely schematic distinctions or to theorizing. Least of all can ethnogeographic material be made to subserve a theory of evolutionary development. It also requires an intimate knowledge rather painstakingly acquired. Much more attention has therefore been devoted by anthropologists to fields in which slender materials offered the allure of readier generalizations. But, as it is accepted that no ethnological principles can pretend to much validity that do not rest on an understanding of the involved civilizations as wholes, so no civilization can be wholly known without the geographic basis which is its soil in the metaphorical as well as physical sense. This is perhaps doubly true for the ethnologist who is not a formal environmentalist.

Our gratitude is therefore due Mr. Harrington: first for undertaking the task, and second, for carrying it through with unusual conscience, exhaustiveness, and adequacy. The literature, even if bad or indifferent, is always connected with the new data presented. The form and meaning of native names are rendered most carefully. A mass of correlated matter is brought in, although not strictly geographic. Even the mapping has been done afresh wherever existing bases were wrong or insufficient.

Only one stricture can be placed; and this on the ground of omission. Except for a few pages introducing the long section on place-names, there is no summing up, no inferences, no generalized connecting of Tewa geography with Tewa culture. The work, for all its value, remains a huge dictionary arranged geographically instead of alphabetically. The plan of presentation is carefully worked out: when the reader has appreciated this, and the quantity and quality of the contained data, and is